NACOLE Regional Conference

August 27-28, 2025

San Francisco

CPRB attendees – Bailey, Chang, Zimmermann, + Engelbart (Day 2)

80+ attendees total; all Bay Area Oversight agencies, plus LA & Rochester NY

Al use in law enforcement –

Speakers: C3AI, Skydio, PeregrineTechnologies, Agentforce, Veritone, SFPD

Al used for –

- * Labelling video footage
- * Redaction of public records
- * Coordinating/Scanning multiple databases
- * Generative AI (e.g., ChatGPT) for report writing; search warrants
- * Al assisted autonomous drone flights

Lessons –

- * Importance of transparency and human review for accuracy
- * SFPD pilot re AI assisted report writing hoped that increased efficiency would free up officers' time but time required to check reports for accuracy negated that; a goal should be to give officer more time to write better narratives; would be good if AI used to include policy guidelines with the officer's input
 - * SF has city-wide policy on use of AI; SFPD does not allow use of facial recognition

AI (Continued)

- Al can help oversight investigators esp. for review of BWC video, etc.; can check other databases for officer and supervisor names to compare re use of force reports, complaints, etc.; can help identify the officer "outliers" "early warning" to identify problems
- Risks of AI in report writing can make us lazy, remove context; also AI learns from repetition, so common terms like "furtive movement" can be offered by AI to fill in the blanks in an officer's narrative
- Important that any AI generated documents include the sources
- CA SB 524 bill pending requires PD policy on AI, audit trail, transparency when AI used, prohibits AI generated first draft of officer statement unless reviewed and approved by officer
- The technology changing so rapidly, so no need to leap; learn about the technology first, and understand current data systems and work flows used
- Concern: As officer dependency on AI increases, will that reduce officer's intuition and empathy/rapport with the public

Keynote: Prof. Jennifer Eberhardt

- Stanford social psychologist re racial profiling/implicit bias
- Bias exacerbates disparities
- Implicit bias effects everyone; comes in ways that we are unaware of
- What we see and where we look impacts law enforcement practices
- "The shadow cast by that we do not see." (MLK, Jr.)
- * Recommend Sojourner implicit bias training (used by SFPD)
- Disrupting bias: Next Door concerns re racial profiling; added prompts to ask for specifics if say see something "suspicious" – adds "friction"

Implementation of Responsible AI Policies –

Speakers: SF City AI Policy (Padelli), Future Policing Institute (Mannheimer), Stanford Law (Dutton)

- SF City pilot all staff given MS CoPilot app with guidelines for use
- See InnovateUS for training re responsible AI use
- Police leaders share some of the same concerns about AI use as oversight, but PD's being driven to use AI tools because of the shear volume of data they now receive (BWC, ALPR, etc.)
- "Get it right rather than worry about being late!"
- Need to test for bias in AI system
- Need to be transparent when AI used
- Importance of live person reviews/check points in process
- Amend existing policies to note AI tools used
- See IACP model AI policy www.cop-ai.org
- Al raises same need for security and privacy protections as with other data

Communications/Community Engagement –

Presentation by Oakland city depts.

- Created card/chart to clarify what issues each of the various City accountability offices handle (CPRA, OIG, Auditor, Ethics Comm.)
- Use listening tours in community; mapped complaints to prioritize neighborhoods for outreach; piggy-back with other depts' outreach
- See FB/Instagram sites of community orgs that wish to contact/share info
- Importance of onboarding new Board members
- Include key police data on oversight website
- Consider community surveys and focus groups
- Make community aware of oversight resource needs
- Use ethnic media
- Issue: Educating public about limits of authority

ICE and local police

Speakers: Immigration legal services, ACSO, Fed prosecutor,

- State Values Act and local sanctuary city ordinances preclude cooperation with immigration enforcement
- CA Truth Act promotes "know your rights" for immigrants
- Oversight role to ensure that local police are following city and state sanctuary laws
- Need to clarify for the public who is engaged in enforcement activities i.e., to identify when feds not local police involved; or when local undercover police involved, not feds
- Educate public demonstrators to avoid putting themselves in harms way when feds on the scene
- Maintain links between immigrant rights advocates and local police
- A challenge: Local police duty to intervene when observe fed agents improper use of force

RIPA data analysis & discrimination investigations

- Resource: Berkeley Institute of Data Science
- RIPA reporting based on perceived race by the officer
- SF DPA audit of SFPD RIPA data found incomplete reports, officers misidentifying drivers as White and particular days when no stops were reported;
 - www.DPA-SF.goc/audit
- National database shut down so can't compare with State data
- Cited studies from fed DOJ, NYU and others
- Importance of ongoing internal audits of RIPA data re compliance with reporting requirements, identification of outliers and anomalies in the data, and clean the data by cross-checking with other databases (DMV, CLETS)
- Note resistance by POA's to the CA RIPA Board's annual reports; PORAC hired statisticians to challenge the Bd.'s analysis (their primary complaint is attributing discriminatory intent to data on stops)
- Challenge to educate the public re what the data showsDPA-SF

Oversight under attack post-George Floyd

- Historically there have been pendulum swings on support for oversight
- Importance of being strategic in communications with the public about reports, meetings, etc.
- Local civilian oversight all the more important now with Executive Branch actions to reverse federal DOJ oversight (e.g., cancelling pattern and practice investigations)
- Defend oversight budget to ensure sufficient resources to carry out mandated oversight functions