

**City of San Leandro
Community Development Department
Planning Services Division
Staff Report**

DATE: December 18, 2014

TO: Planning Commission

FROM: Elmer Penaranda, Senior Planner

SUBJECT: **PLN2014-00044;** Rezone from RS Residential Single-Family District to RS(PD) Residential Single-Family, Planned Development Overlay District; and Planned Development to construct a subdivision consisting of four detached, two-story, single-family residences that would comprise between 1,493-1,630 square feet of living area, which includes three bedrooms and three baths. Each unit would have an attached two-car garage. Unaddressed Parcel on Warren Avenue, between 396 and 476 Warren Avenues; Alameda County Assessor's Parcel Number 77-572-10; J. Cannizzaro, Cannizzaro Realty Inc. (applicant); Jefferson Building Inc. (property owner).

SUMMARY AND RECOMMENDATION

The applicant proposes to develop an underutilized property at the north side of Warren Avenue, between East 14th Street and Bancroft Avenue, with a four-unit, detached, two-story single-family residential subdivision. Each unit would comprise of three bedrooms, three bathrooms, and an attached two-car garage. The subject property is just south of the City's Downtown and east of the East 14th Street South Area Corridor.

The applicant has conducted outreach to the adjacent neighborhood and received positive comments about the proposed project. The proposal, being within 300 feet of a City Historic Resource (Victorian Residence at 310 Warren Avenue), required review by the City's Library-Historic Commission (Historic Preservation Ordinance). After its review it moved to approve the proposed development for referral to the Planning Commission for further action.

Staff believes that the project is well designed and appropriate to its existing context. The proposal with front porches and a typical 20 foot landscaped setback blends in with the existing character of the neighborhood. The second story is tiered back atop the building and has varying roof lines. These are preferred design techniques with two-story design that de-emphasizes a new home's mass and scale. In addition, the proposed materials, finishes, and architectural features would complement the existing setting and the neighborhood. With the recommended Conditions of Approval staff recommends that the Planning Commission consider staff's proposed Findings for project approval (attached Recommended Findings of Fact) and adopt the attached Resolution Recommending that the City Council:

- A. Adopt the Categorical Exemption from CEQA Guidelines;
- B. Approve a Rezone of the subject site from RS Residential Single-Family District to RS(PD) Residential Single-Family, Planned Development Overlay District; and

- C. Approve a Planned Development, PLN2014-00044, subject to the Recommended Conditions of Approval.

APPLICANT'S SUPPORTING STATEMENT

See attached.

RELATIONSHIP TO SURROUNDING AREA

The unaddressed subject property on the north side of Warren Avenue is undeveloped and encompasses 19,248 square feet. Adjacent properties to the east, south, west and north are developed with single-family homes with the exception of the adjacent property to the northeast which is developed with a four unit condominium. The subject property and adjacent parcels are zoned RS Residential Single-Family District with the exception of condominium developments in the proximity to the north, fronting Sybil Avenue, which are zoned RM3000(PD) Residential Multi-Family Planned Development Overlay District.

DETAILS OF THE PROPOSAL

Site Plan, Floor Plan and Parking

The subject property measures 120 feet in width and 160.4 feet in depth, encompassing 19,248 square feet (0.44 acre). The parcel would be subdivided into four smaller parcels at approximately 60 feet wide by 80 feet deep (4,800 square feet) and each would contain a detached single-family home. The residential buildings would be situated along the front and interior edges of the rectangular site. A centrally located driveway would serve to access the four buildings that flank the driveway and the two buildings located at the rear of the site. (See attached exhibits).

A subdivision for four units or less does not require a Tentative Map. Thus the subdivision map for the development would be prepared and processed separately from this application as a Parcel Map only, if it is approved by the City Council.

The proposed homes along the Warren Avenue frontage would maintain a 20-foot front yard setback, the minimum requirement in the single-family neighborhoods. The setbacks from the east and west sides would be seven feet where the minimum required is five feet. The proposed homes along the rear of the subject site would be setback 18.5 feet where 15 feet is the minimum requirement.

The single-family homes are two-story. The front units have a living area of 1,493 square feet and the rear units have a living area of 1,630 square feet (see attached Exhibit A – Site and Unit Plans, Sheet A-1). The ground floor of the front units will comprise 922 square feet and the second floor will comprise 571 square feet. The ground floor of the rear units will be larger, with 1,026 square feet, and the second floor will comprise 604 square feet. Each ground floor will include a living room, dining room, kitchen, one bathroom, and one bedroom. Each second floor will include two bedrooms, two bathrooms, and closet for a washer and dryer. The storage rooms on the ground floor would be intended for recyclables and solid waste containers.

The project would have 16 off-street parking spaces which include eight garage spaces and eight driveway spaces. Four units on 19,248 square feet equal a density of one unit per 4,812 square feet (nine units per acre; single-family development density).

The driveway would access the attached garages to the residences, and the uncovered driveway spaces in front of the garages. The plans show a combination of concrete and asphalt for the paving. Scored concrete would be the decorative paving that is proposed for the entry of the central driveway. The short driveways accessing the garages will also be concrete. The remaining central driveway that will not be concrete will be asphaltic concrete.

Elevations

The proposed two-story elevations are designed with stucco walls, horizontal siding, trimmed windows and low-pitched roofs with composition shingle. In addition, the proposed elevations include covered front porches, Craftsman-style front doors, bracketed gables and rafter tails. The garages will have decorative sectional roll-up doors. The second floor space are tiered back to lessen the bulk and mass of the elevations along with low-pitch hipped roof design. The height to the top of the ridges would be 25 feet where the maximum permitted in the single-family district is 30 feet.

In addition, the proposed color palette for the building exteriors will include three body colors using earth-tones. Exhibit B contains a streetscape with the various colors on the drawing.

Landscaping

The proposed landscape plan and palette shows the applicant's intent to provide a palette containing trees, flowering trees, shrubs, ground covers, vines, and mulch for the project (see Exhibits D and E.).

STAFF ANALYSIS

In November 2005, the proposed development plan for the subject property was for three duplexes, totaling six residential units. At that time the immediate neighbors expressed concern about the density having too many units. Also at that time, staff had concerns that the architectural design was not compatible and did not blend in with the architectural context of the existing neighborhood which is American Foursquare, Craftsman, Victorian Queen Anne, small Spanish/Mediterranean and small ranch-style homes.

Nine years later, the developer has revised the proposed development plans to a lesser density and the architectural exterior design enhanced. As a result, the project has been well received by the neighbors and some have provided their support of the plans. In addition, after review of the proposed plans the Library-Historical Commission and staff have provided a favorable recommendation on the application.

The proposed project is within 300 feet of 310-312 Warren Avenue, a residence from 1900, deemed a historic resource. Pursuant to the Historical Preservation Ordinance (Ordinance No. 2003-014), the Library-Historical Commission has the opportunity to review the project and comment on whether the proposed development would have an impact on the setting of the historic building. After its review on October 2, 2014, the Library-Historical Commission moved to approve the proposed development for referral to the Planning Commission for further action (See attached Library-Historical Commission Meeting Minutes of October 21, 2014, page 2.).

Land Use/Density

The proposed density of detached single-family is a compatible development proposal. The detached unit design lessens any impact of the project appearing overdeveloped to the adjacent residential area.

Reasons for Planned Development

The proposal requires the division of property into single-family parcels with less area than the 5,000 square-foot minimum requirement (Zoning Code Section 2-530). The planned development will request an exception to this minimum requirement in the Zoning Code. Although the parcels contain less than less 5,000 square feet the proposed project conforms to the allowable density in the RS Residential Single-Family District; four units.

The purpose of the Planned Development is to encourage creativity and avoid monotony in developments by allowing greater freedom in selecting the means to provide access, light, open space and amenities. The proposal provides a plan which is adequately accessed and provides amenities such as off-street parking, landscaped setbacks and planters, and usable yards.

Private Yards

Private yard areas are intended for all of the units and are practical usable spaces. The front units have private yards with an approximate dimension of 12 feet by 25 feet and the rear units have larger private yards that would be greater than 18.5 feet by 60 feet.

Vehicle Access and Circulation

The Engineering and Transportation Department and Fire Department have found vehicle access acceptable for the central driveway.

Parking

The proposed off-street parking spaces satisfies the basic requirement for two covered off-street parking spaces in the attached garages and additional parking on the driveways leading to the garages. The future Parcel Map will be required to include a Declaration of Covenants, Conditions, and Restrictions (CC&Rs) that requires strict enforcement in managing its private property rules such as maintaining the off-street parking for vehicle use, and prohibiting storage in the garage or uncovered parking spaces. These requirements will be listed in the recommended conditions of approval. With strict enforcement of these requirements the proposed parking is adequate for the project.

Architecture/Design

The architecture for the new homes is well designed to blend into and to be compatible with the existing neighborhood. To further ensure the quality of the development and to carry out the depicted proposed design of the attached Exhibits, staff recommends the following conditions for the exterior design of the homes.

1. A minimum of two paint color schemes containing the use of three or more colors.
2. The use of three or more materials on the façade (i.e., cement plaster, horizontal siding, wood or decorative metal railing for the porches).
3. Covered porch with railing.
4. Wood front doors with minimum four true lights.
5. Vertical appearing windows with raised trim.
6. Sectional garage doors with windows. Automatic electric garage door opener
7. Decorative exterior light fixtures.

Landscaping

The landscape plan supplements the architectural plans with intent to complement the proposed residential project with flowering plants and colorful foliage. However the front setback and central driveway planters appear to have large areas with chipped stone mulch. Staff recommends that in these areas the proposed landscape plans include greater number of trees, and greater coverage of understory shrub planting. Tree and shrub planting will be required to be a minimum size of 15 gallons and five gallons, respectively. Ground cover could be introduced as one-gallon size or from flats with the necessary spacing. Paved patio areas and walkways are shown the plans. The revised landscape plan can be required to be reviewed and approved by the Community Development Director prior to the issuance of Building Permit.

Fencing

The eastern, western and northern property lines will be required to be improved with six-foot tall solid wood fencing, with the exception of the 20-foot front yard setback where the maximum height of fencing will be three feet. There will also be six-foot tall fencing to enclose and secure the private rear yards to the units. The Zoning Code permits seven foot tall fences in the RS District in the event the applicant wishes to construct fences taller than six feet for the perimeters or private yards. If the applicant chooses to build a seven-foot fence, it would be approved at staff level. Staff recommends that, prior to issuance of building permits, details for new wood fencing along the perimeters and picket fencing in the front yard setback be submitted. The details shall include the design, materials, height and location of all new fences.

Paving

The specifications to the colored concrete was not noted on the site plan. Staff recommends that the final color be subject to the review and approval of the Community Development Director. At a minimum, the concrete should include a fair amount of lamp black (concrete color additive) for a gray color. Gray is preferred to white which is stark in appearance and emits excessive glare.

Inclusionary (Affordable) Unit Requirement

For residential developments of for-sale projects of six or fewer units, the Inclusionary Housing Ordinance requirements may be satisfied by paying an in-lieu fee. The fee is the median sales price of a single-family dwelling unit in San Leandro, minus the Affordable Ownership Cost, multiplied by the fractional inclusionary units required. The fractional inclusionary unit required for the four-unit project would be 0.6. The in-lieu fee will be due upon issuance of the building permit. The estimate at the time of this report is \$28,140.

Parcel Map

A Parcel Map will eventually be required if this proposed project is approved. The Map will show the proposed property line boundaries, the common area, and infrastructure serving the proposed development. The Map would be required to conform to the proposed Planned Development already described in this report.

A recommended condition of approval would require the developer to draft the Declaration of Covenants, Conditions and Restrictions (CC&Rs) as part of the Parcel Map application. The CC&Rs will contain language specifying the future property owners' responsibilities as a homeowner's

association in maintaining the paved driveway and uncovered parking areas. In addition, the CC&Rs should include the property owners' individual responsibilities in maintaining their respective yards free of clutter and parking spaces available for vehicle parking.

GENERAL PLAN CONFORMANCE

The General Plan Land Use Map designates the subject property as Low Density Residential. This designation is intended for detached single-family homes and is characterized by lots with 5,000 square feet. This is the predominant residential development type in San Leandro and includes most neighborhoods developed between 1925 and 1990. Overall densities range from 3-6 units per gross acre (up to approximately nine (9) units per net acre). The proposed four units on the 0.44 net acre equals nine (9) units per net acre. In this case, the proposed development conforms to the density specified by the General Plan.

The rezoning of the project site from RS Residential Single-Family District to RS(PD) Residential Single-Family, Planned Development Overlay District will subject any proposal on the property to the City's discretionary review process, which will ensure that the new development will be compatible with the existing area

In addition, the proposal will attain the following General Plan policies, related to the supply and upkeep of the City's housing stock.

Policy 2.05 - Alterations, Additions and In-Fill Ensure that alterations, additions and infill development are compatible with existing homes and maintain aesthetically pleasing neighborhoods.

Policy 3.01 - Mix of Unit Types Encourage a mix of residential development types in the City, including single-family homes on a variety of lot sizes, as well as townhomes, row houses, live-work units, planned unit developments, and multi-family housing.

Policy 3.04 – Promotion of Infill Encourage infill development on vacant or underused sites within residential areas.

Policy 53.03-C – In Lieu Fees for Affordable Housing Implement City policy on the payment of in-lieu fees as an alternative to meeting the City inclusionary housing requirements on-site. While the City encourages inclusionary units to be provided on-site, this may not be feasible in all instances (for instance, when the project contains fewer than six units). Formal criteria for allowing in-lieu fees are established and a consistent formula for determining the fees has been adopted.

The proposal will provide an opportunity for ownership of four individual units. The new single-family dwellings will be an attractive improvement on the subject site. Moreover, with the necessary conditions relating to landscaping, fencing, building code compliance, property maintenance, and the creation of CC&Rs (Conditions, Covenants and Restrictions), would ensure the appearance of the property will be enhanced and maintained in an attractive and clean manner. The required in-lieu fee for affordable housing would benefit the City's Affordable Housing Trust Fund in providing and/or assisting in future inclusionary housing projects in the City.

ENVIRONMENTAL ANALYSIS

This project is categorically exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) per CEQA Guideline Article 19, Categorical Exemption, Section 15332 In-fill Development projects.

PUBLIC OUTREACH

Notices for the public hearing were mailed to the property owners within 500 feet of the subject property. Placards were posted on the utility poles adjacent to the subject property. A legal advertisement was published in the Daily Review newspaper.

The applicant conducted two outreach meetings with the neighborhood. The applicant summarized in the attached supporting statement that the meetings guided the proposal to a lesser density and provision for off-street parking in the development plan. These were the main points that neighbors were able to support the proposed plan.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends that the Planning Commission consider staff's proposed Findings for project approval (attached Recommended Findings of Fact) and adopt the attached Resolution Recommending that the City Council:

- A. Adopt the Categorical Exemption from CEQA Guidelines;
- B. Approve a Rezone of the subject site from RS Residential Single-Family District to RS(PD) Residential Single-Family, Planned Development Overlay District; and
- C. Approve a Planned Development, PLN2014-00044, subject to the Recommended Conditions of Approval.

ATTACHMENTS

Applicant's Supporting Statement with Neighbors' Signatures for Support

Vicinity Map

City of San Leandro Library-Historical Commission Meeting Minutes of October 21, 2014 (page 2)

Recommended Findings of Fact

Recommended Conditions of Approval

Resolution with Recommended Categorical Exemption from CEQA Guidelines, Zoning Map Amendment and Conditions of Approval (referenced)

Exhibit A – Site/Unit Plans (Sheet A-1)

Exhibit B – Exterior Elevations (Sheet A-2)

Exhibit C – Photographs of Existing Site Conditions and Adjacent Properties (Sheet A-3)

Exhibit D – Landscape Plan (Sheet L-1)

Exhibit E – Landscape Palette and Amenities (Sheet L-2)

Exhibit F – Record Boundary and Topographic Survey

For Information Only – Aerial Photograph and Streeviews, Warren Avenue

G:\Planning\CURRENT PLANNING Project Files\Planning Commission\2014\PLN2014-00044 Warren Avenue PD 4 Units\PLN2014-00044 PC Staff Report 12-18-2014.doc